ECCE HOMO, OR JESUS IN THE RED JAPANESE GARMENT: SHŪSAKU ENDŌ'S *SILENCE* IN EAST AND WEST

Akiyoshi Suzuki*

Abstract: Two cinema adaptations of Shūsaku Endō's Chinmoku [Silence] *exist: one by Masahiro Shinoda and another by Martin Scorsese, or the East and the West. While Scorsese's version closely follows the novel's plot, Shinoda's, with its striking red garment and a controversial sex scene, is often seen as a departure. This article challenges that view. Drawing on previous studies and historical context, I establish that Silence explores the feminization or maternalization of Christianity. I then analyze how the English translation influenced Scorsese's cinema, reinforcing a paternalistic vision of Christianity. In contrast, I argue that Shinoda's depiction of Rodriguez aligns with the Ecce Homo metal tablet, a relic of Nagasaki's hidden Christians, symbolizing a feminized Christ through cinematic techniques. Ultimately, I conclude that Shinoda's adaptation is more faithful to the novel's core themes than Scorsese's.*

Introduction

The area of Japanese literature set in Nagasaki, Japan, a site of extensive persecution of Christians between 1612 and 1873, and dealing with Christian themes, is called *Kirishitan bungaku* (Christian literature) in Japan. Many modern literary works of this type appear to sell themselves on their exoticism, using depictions of the Nagasaki dialect and Nagasaki's hybrid culture, which draws on influences from Portugal, the Netherlands, China, and Japan, rather than clearly considering and depicting the oppression of Christians in Nagasaki. Such literature is, as Tsuboi (2002), Tsuruta (2006), and Suzuki (2016) note, written from the point of view of a Tokyo chauvinism or Tokyo centrism, presenting a type of internal colonization, exoticizing the local and depicting its local customs as barbaric, in which Nagasaki is shown as foreign. Because of the discriminatory nature of their style, many works of Christian literature are viewed critically. Nagayo characterizes this as follows: "Writers of Christian literature, in order to make the atmosphere of Nagasaki come to the fore, usually make the characters use the Nagasaki dialect or try to create a so-called 'exotic' flavor. In short, Christian literature usually ends up with something that does not leave the hobbyistic and playful mood" (Yamada, 1968, 269). Ryū says, "how Christians lived a hard life by reciting the oratio in secret under the continuing oppression and chose martyrdom or conversion in silence, must be the issue of our time" (1968, 268).

Shūsaku Endō's world-famous novel *Chinmoku* [*Silence*] (1966), which depicts the harsh life of Christians in early modern Japan and focuses on priests working in Nagasaki, is an outstanding work of Christian literature. This novel has been adapted to cinema twice: *Chinmoku SILENCE* (1971), directed by Masahiro Shinoda, and *Silence* (2016), directed by Martin Scorsese. Shinoda's cinema has been criticized, for example by Kitamura (2021), because it does not address the issue of faith head-on, clothing its characters in a long, kimono-like garment, and adding sex scenes that are not present in the Japanese source text, turning the story into an exotic Orientalist tale of sexuality and of the lost. In Shinoda's cinema, the characters speak both English and Japanese, and when the Japanese characters speak Japanese, they always use the Nagasaki dialect. The presence of the Nagasaki dialect, which remains faithful to the source text, in the filmic context enhances the setting's exoticism, making this work another typical example of the Christian literature that Ryū and

* Dr. AKIYOSHI SUZUKI, Professor of American Literature and Comparative Literature, Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences, Nagasaki University, Nagasaki, Japan. Email: suzu-a@nagasaki-u.ac.jp.

others criticize. However, Scorsese's cinema does not feature scenes that are far from the source text, nor does he cut the final chapter, "The Diary of an Officer at the Christian Residence, or Rodrigues/Okada San'emon's House" in the way that Shinoda's cinema does. Hence, even though the Nagasaki dialect completely disappears in his work, Scorsese's version is seen as closer to the source text than Shinoda's version.

However, in the Nagasaki context, the red garment can be regarded as representing Jesus Christ and the strong faith of Christianity. Thus, Shinoda's work, which retains the Nagasaki dialect and the flavor of Nagasaki, is not a cinema that exemplifies poor-quality Christian literature, but rather is faithful in spirit to the Japanese source text. This is addressed in this paper through the introduction of a historical artifact that relates the red garment shown in the cinema to a feature of life in Nagasaki. For this, in the next section, I confirm the theme of *Silence* and the distance between Scorsese's cinema and the Japanese source text of the novel through a discussion of the English translation for which Scorsese wrote the introduction and on which he based his cinema.

I. Maternalization of Christianity in the Novel and Nagasaki

A range of studies have discussed the world depicted in Endō's *Silence*. Readings of its subject, founded on the Japanese source text, as noted by Lee (2008), generally summarize it as a work that directly concerns itself with the nature of God as seen in Christ through the matter of God's existence, the psychology of apostasy, and the ideological break between East and West. This view produces the result that Endō feminizes or maternalizes Western Christianity based on the authority of a strong father figure and obedience to him, as well as ideas of sin and punishment, into a Christianity that suffers with others and offers forgiveness. According to Endō's view of religion, as he himself states (1967a), there are two types: the religion of the father and the religion of the mother. In the former, God and Jesus Christ are strict and demand much from the worshiper, judging, punishing, and showing anger against sin, but in the latter, God and Jesus Christ forgive and suffer with a person, just as a mother does with a poorly behaved child.

This view of feminization or maternalization becomes clear in the novel's final part, referred to as the appendix in the English translation. In the Japanese source text, the title of this chapter is "The Diary of an Officer at the Christian Residence." While this aspect is sometimes overlooked in discussions of *Silence,* this diary reveals that Rodriguez and Kichijirō, who some readers consider to have abandoned Christianity, repeatedly return to their faith, in contrast to Ferreira, who becomes an apostate and never reclaims it. As *Silence* concludes with this depiction, it becomes clear that *Silence* focuses on the role of forgiveness and repentance in Christianity. Endō understands the nature of a believer as someone "who is constantly frustrated, loses sight of God, and pursues God again" (1992, 220). Several scholars, including Kazusa (1987, 159), observe that, as a result, Kichijirō, who has abandoned Christianity but has regained his faith before, is more often considered the protagonist of *Silence* than Rodriguez, who has abandoned Christianity. The ability to repeat apostasy and regain one's faith could contribute to a feminization of the God of Christianity and of Jesus Christ.

This maternalization is a feature of Rodriguez's and Kichijirō's thinking and finds expression in the face of Jesus Christ seen in Rodriguez's eyes. The alteration of Jesus's face into a weak and suffering image directly reflects Rodriguez's mind, as he repeatedly states that the Bible nowhere presents Jesus's face (Endō, 1981, 30, 103). Endō also wrote that "for me the most important thing is the change in the face of Jesus Christ that the foreigner protagonist [Rodriguez] had in his mind" (2000, 175). Endō called this change, taking place in the face of Christ and Rodriguez's mind, "the warp and woof of the theme of *Silence*" (2000,

175). He noted that Etō Jun (1967), a Japanese critic, observed that the face of Jesus in the *fumi-e*, or a tablet bearing the image of Christ,[1] is the face of a Japanese mother (2000, 175), agreeing with Etō's observation regarding motherliness in this connection (1967b; 1991; 2000). Rodriguez initially relies on the strong image of Christ as depicted in the West, but after coming face to face with the fumi-e, he finds the face of Christ weary, tired, and in suffering, like humanity. Finally, in front of the *fumi-e* tablet, Jesus Christ speaks to Rodriguez; he never makes him choose martyrdom but remains beside him, suffering with him. Christ's voice also appears in Rodriguez's subjectivity. In the Japanese source text, Christ says, "*Fumu ga ii*." This Japanese sentence is, as Yamane notes (McMillan et al., 2003, 191) and as Gessel (2017, 57–58, 59–60, 62) agrees, not a command, as the translated in English "Trample!", but rather is something like what a mother who shares the pain and suffering of her own child might say, namely, that "I understand your suffering, your pain, so it is all right. Go ahead and trample" (Katō et al., 2017, 115).

It is worth noting that this maternalization or feminization of Christianity actually occurred in Nagasaki itself, the setting of *Silence*. In Nagasaki, certainly, some Christians willingly chose death amid the suppression of Christianity. For instance, according to Koizumi (2018), who carefully examined many letters sent to the Vatican by missionaries in Japan from around 1603 to 1624, many who the Shogunate had prevented from practicing the Christian faith gladly confessed their sins and were killed instead of apostatizing; others escaped the Shogunate's eye and continued to practice their faith while in hiding. The Catholic Church officially called for martyrdom among its believers before apostasy. One well-known example of this is found in *The Book of Martyrdom*. This work consists of three sermons, one of which, according to Hazama (2008), the "Martyr's Guide," holds that martyrdom is an honor for a true Christian and that, hence, believers should be willing to suffer persecution —the only way to be with Christ. Later, however, as religious oppression in Japan intensified, the Christians in Nagasaki produced "Oratio of Forgiveness" and developed other forms of forgiveness to protect themselves and to ask for forgiveness from God. These orations were used when, for example, a Christian was forced to step on a holy picture or a cross by officials under pain of death should they refuse (Koizumi, 2018, 146). Onishi (2012) attributes this shift to a change in the interpretation of the Sacrament of Confession that accompanied Valignano's third pilgrimage to Japan from 1597 to 1603. In the 1591 edition of the Dochirina Kirishitan, "contrition" (*contrição*) and "confession" (*confissan*) were inseparably linked, but in the 1600 Roman edition of the Dochirina Kirishitan, "a temporal respite" was added between them. Because the Council of Trent included a line in its regulations that reconciliation with God was only possible through true contrition, on the condition that confession was ultimately intended, such that even if no priest was present and if the believer intended to confess at a later point, the confession was considered to be acceptable in the future, provided that the perfect contrition was fulfilled. In other words, the rule from the early 1590s that confession had to be made to a priest once a year was interpreted in the late 1590s to mean that forgiveness of sins (even mortal sins) could be accomplished through self-inflicted contrition alone (Onishi, 2012, 9).

These factors can be considered as the background for the feminization or maternalization of Christianity presented in *Silence*. In addition to these, we must not forget the phenomenon of Marian devotion in Catholicism, which was the first form of Christianity introduced to Japan, as well as the "Nagasaki-ness" that forms an inevitable part of *Silence*, set in Nagasaki. The orientation of the Catholic Church toward Mary holds that she is

[1] Fumi-e as an action is a religious test used in Edo-period Japan, where suspected Christians were forced to step on an image of Jesus or the Virgin Mary to prove they had renounced their faith. Refusal often led to persecution.

subordinate to Christ, yet in a unique position above all other things in creation. When Francis Xavier arrived in Japan on August 15, 1549, the day of the Assumption of Mary, to begin the first Christian mission there, he dedicated Japan to the Virgin Mary, praying that the Japanese people would live happily under Mary's care. The chalk statue of Mary at the front door of the Ōura Church, where Bishop Bernard-Thadée Petitjean discovered Japanese Christians in 1865, is known as the Statue of the Holy Mother of Japan. However, as Bishop Petitjean noted in his homily, the name "Holy Mother of Japan" was not given because the believers and the church were newly dedicated to Mary at that time, but rather because churches in Japan had been under her protection from the beginning. When the Pope entrusted him with missionary work in Japan, he dedicated himself and his church entirely to her as the most merciful Mother (Ōura Church, n.d.). Interestingly, as Amaro (2016), who has a thorough knowledge of the correspondence of the Jesuit missionaries in Japan, reported in detail, when Xavier first came to Kagoshima, the Japanese who saw the statue of Mary thought it looked like a statue of Kannon. They considered Christianity to be a sect of Buddhism. This view has also been subject to interpretation issues. Thus, in *Silence*, for instance, "the peasants confused Christianity with Buddhism, thinking that they were the same thing. Even Xavier […] came near to failure on this point. Some Japanese […] thought that our God was the sun, with the people of this country having revered it for many generations" (Endō, 1981, 108). *Silence* also refers to Marianism in Nagasaki. The character of Rodriguez says, "these poor peasants honored the Virgin above all. Indeed, I myself, since coming to Tomogi, have been a little worried seeing that the peasants sometimes seem to honor Mary rather than Christ" (Endō, 1981, 85). The hidden Christians had a Marian Kannon, a statue of the Bodhisattva Avalokitesvara imitating Virgin Mary, as an object of devotion, not because they were hidden but because they were Marianists in the first place. When Bishop Petitjean discovered Japanese Christians while praying in front of the altar in the Ōura Church, a middle-aged woman named Sugimoto Yuri, a member of the groups of hidden Christians, approached the bishop and whispered, "Where is the statue of Santa Maria?" (Urakawa, 1915, 150–155). Ōmura Sumitada, the first Christian feudal lord of Japan, who ruled Nagasaki and sanctified Nagasaki to the Jesuits, was also a Marianist.

In addition, it is known that Jews and convicts in Portugal left their country and traveled to Nagasaki before the Portuguese missionaries' arrival. These groups opposed Christianity. When missionaries arrived from Portugal, they sought to avoid being hindered in their work by anti-Christians from their home country, who would preach Christianity to them again, or by being resisted in the Christian mission. These Portuguese, as well as the Japanese, caused difficulties for them. The missionaries were forced to deal with these opponents in a foreign land (Amaro, 2016) and inevitably had to adopt a forgiving approach. This is the case of Rodriguez, arriving in Nagasaki in *Silence*. It is not the case that when Rodriguez comes to Japan, he witnesses that Christianity is feminized or maternalized, but rather that he experiences a feminized or maternalized Christianity.

Endō wrote *Silence* after encountering the objects of faith possessed by the hidden Christians in Nagasaki, namely, the Marian Kannon and Nodojin, a deity enshrined in a closet. In his 1971 essay *Kirishitan no Sato* (*The Village of Christian*), published five years after *Silence*, Endō wrote about his own feelings toward apostates in the following terms:

> Apostates are a rotten apple for the Christian church, and they do not want to talk about them. They have to keep a lid on the stink. […] The weak were buried in the ashes of silence of politicians and historians. But the weak are human beings just like us. How can we say that they did not shed tears when they betrayed what they had previously considered their ideals, what they had considered the best and most beautiful things in the world? How can we say that they did not tremble with regret and shame? As a novelist, I could not remain

> indifferent to their grief and pain. Even after they fell down, they continued to clasp their twisted fingers together and chant unspoken prayers, which caused tears to flow down my cheeks as well. (Endō, 1974, 30)

This line of thinking eventually culminated in an image of Jesus as a companion who stands by the weak, depicted in Endō's novel *Samurai* (1980). Although Rodriguez and Kichijirō in *Silence* do not publicly proclaim their faith in *Silence*, it is reasonable to think of that novel, which ends with "The Diary of an Officer," in terms of a story of forgiveness and remorse through their actions as they repeatedly regain their faith.

II. Translation and Scorsese's Cinema: What the Narrative Conceals

So far, I have discussed the themes of the novel *Silence*, developing specific historical facts of the practice of Christianity and the Christians in Nagasaki during the time period of the novel. Based on this discussion, I present an argument about the cinema adaptation of the novel.

The 2016 cinema *Silence* directed by Scorsese is not a remake movie of the earlier cinema *Chinmoku SILENCE* (1971), directed by Shinoda. Both the Shinoda and Scorsese versions were based directly on the novel, in its Japanese source text and its English translation, respectively, as well as on the directors' interpretations of these texts. Suppose the English translation shows gaps in the meaning from the source text. In that case, Scorsese's work must be a less perfect representation of the novel, perhaps even presenting his own idea about Christianity and God, even though Gessel (2017) advised Scorsese regarding possible mistranslations.

Gessel wrote that, hoping to make the cinema more faithful to Endō's intentions than the English translation (2017, 62), he provided Scorsese with suggestions, including pointing out the misunderstanding that is present in the command to "Trample!" (58–59) and the image of Christ, repeatedly indicating to Scorsese that Jesus Christ, as sown in the novel, is kind and stands by the weak (62, 69). Thus, in the scene in Scorsese's cinema where Rodriguez walks on the *fumi-e*, the words "Come ahead, now. It's all right. Step on me" are used instead of "Trample!" Additionally, Gessel (2017, 67, 69) recognized how important "The Diary of an Officer" is for the novel. It might be thought that Scorsese's movie would therefore represent a maternalized Christianity that was more faithful to the Japanese source text.

However, another issue with the translation that Gessel did not point out remains. In the English translation of *Silence*, the narrative point of view is deliberately switched at specific points, most noticeably in Rodriguez's last speech before the text switches to the diary of a government official. The English translation appears to intentionally assert the absolute presence of God the Father by altering the person in Rodriguez's final narrative from that given in the source text.

According to Gérard Genette, "the variations in 'point of view' that occur in the course of narrative can be analyzed as changes in focalization" (1980, 194). Examining these variations, Koshida (2019) drew on previous narrative studies of *Silence* and provides an incisive look at the relationship between the themes and narrative in the Japanese source text. Koshida found that the distance between the narrator and the characters in *Silence* is variable, with the narrative voice falling roughly into three categories: (1) taking a completely objective point of view and describing Rodriguez's feelings and actions from the outside, such that Rodriguez's actions come in for criticism; (2) taking on the voice of the "other" that is inherent in Rodriguez, such as when the narrator that addresses Rodriguez as "you"; here, for instance, the "other" is the person whom Rodriguez later calls "Lord," not a person who actually exists outside of Rodriguez in the narrative, saying "Trample! Your foot suffers in pain; it must suffer like all the feet that have stepped on this plaque. But that pain alone is enough. I

understand your pain and your suffering. It is for that reason that I am here" (Endō, 2015, 256)—this narrator also enters into Rodriguez's mind and speaks as the voice of the "other" within; and (3) speaking directly for Rodriguez's feelings. The second type of narrator is perceived by Rodriguez only as the voice of an "other." Still, in this third narrator, his own voice is reproduced. This is indicated with the use of the first person "I" in the text. Here, the narrator does not make critical remarks about Rodriguez. The scene that follows Rodriguez's apostasy is narrated either by this third type of narrator, who sympathizes with Rodriguez, or by an objective and uncritical narrator (Koshida, 2019, 8). "As it progresses into the second half" and as the third type of narration gradually takes up more of the space from the first type of narration, the novel "becomes less critical, and in the final 'The Diary of an Officer,' there is no critical eye at all" (Koshida, 2019, 10).

As the distance between the narrator and Rodriguez, and any critical perspective, disappears, Rodriguez's faith is neither denied nor affirmed. At the scene of Rodriguez's final speech, just before "The Diary of an Officer," in the Japanese source text, Rodriguez's interior monologue in the first-person narrative presents his belief in God. In addition, although Rodriguez confesses a belief in the existence of God, this is also his subjective opinion. Consciously or unconsciously, *Silence* finally confesses that no one can determine whether God exists outside of the human mind. If God exists, as is often said, this is a God who forgives and suffers with people, just as a mother does with her poorly behaved child (Endō, 2000, 176), not a God who, as in the Western mind, punishes like a father. Therefore, as shown in "The Diary of an Officer," which culminates in *Silence*, Kichijirō and Rodriguez can repeatedly disaffiliate and reaffiliate with their religion.

However, in Western Christian countries, things would be worse if the novel explained that they cannot know whether God exists independently of human beings, any more than God is a motherly being. To avoid the worst-case scenario, the final scene should be written in third-person narrative. This is because the third-person narrative is prioritized as defining the truth of the world, separate from the characters' subjectivity. The English translation version of *Silence* largely shifts to the third person for this part.

The priest had administered that sacrament that only the priest can administer. No doubt his fellows would condemn his act as sacrilege, but even if he was betraying them, he was not betraying his Lord. He loved him now in a different way from before. Everything that had taken place until now had been necessary to bring him to his love. "Even now I am that last priest in his land. But Our Lord was not silent. Even if he had been silent, my life until this day would have spoken to him." (Endō, 2015, 256–257)

Taking a completely objective point of view and describing Rodriguez's feelings and actions from the outside, in interesting contrast to Koshida's (2019) analysis of the Japanese text, the narrator judges, for instance, that "his fellow would condemn his act as sacrilege," "he was not betraying his Lord," "he loved him now in a different way from before," and "everything that had taken place until now had been necessary to bring him to his love." In the English translation, the existence of the Lord of Rodriguez is taken as a fact. Additionally, the Lord is referred to with the male pronoun. The final passages given in the first-person narrative provide, therefore, Rodriguez's confirmation of the presence of a paternalistic God and providence as a fact. This, together with the translation of the imperative reviewed above, which appears to present God and Jesus Christ in the role of the strict Father, presents Rodriguez's own solution to the work of God, which he could not logically understand, in the face of God the Father. Here, there is no question of how to perceive a God who may or may not exist or of a feminized God, but rather only one of Rodriguez's religious realizations in the face of God, who certainly exists. In other words, this text demonstrates the strength of his faith and his paternalistic view of God.

An English translation of this novel should strive to avoid the limitations inherent in the perspective of Western Christian societies, as exemplified in *Silence*. The beginning of *Silence* describes Ferreira's apostasy as "a humiliating defeat for the faith itself and the whole of Europe" rather than "simply the failure of one individual" (Endō, 1981, 10). Father Federico Barbaro and Father Aloisio Delcor (n.d.) wrote a rebuttal to Endō in the magazine *Catholic Life,* claiming that Endō justified the use of a *fumi-e* in his novel. They criticized it, saying, "Christ would not be the banner of the noble path where humankind should walk, but the apostle of human weakness and vileness, and the greatest betrayer of what is most holy and noble in humankind" (29). An English translation might seek to respond to this by restoring honor to the characters at the novel's conclusion.

These considerations seem to have influenced Scorsese's filmmaking. In his final cremation scene, the voiceover conveys the fact that the man named Rodriguez met the end that the people wanted, as an apostate, but as for his mind, only God knows. This is tantamount to indicating the unquestionable existence of God, independent from any human mind. Kitamura notes that Scorsese's cinema concludes by adding scenes to the end of the story that are not in either the Japanese or the English version of the novel; by doing so, he modifies the cinema, moving it toward "the logic of the strong" (2021, 241). First, after the *fumi-e* scene, when Ferreira and Rodriguez go to the magistrate's office to identify whether any forbidden Christian articles had been brought in from abroad, Ferreira, upon finding a cross, utters "Our Lord." This suggests that Ferreira, acting superficially as an apostate, may not have actually abandoned his faith. Second, after Rodriguez becomes Okada San'emon, he foreheads Kichijirō, who comes to confession, in the same way he did previously to Mokichi, as if expressing that their feelings are in agreement. Third, in the scene following that showing the *fumi-e*, Kichijirō wears an amulet with an image of a saint around his neck, which officials recognize. This scene reveals the depth of Kichijirō's faith, as he continues to believe in God. Fourth, the final cremation scene ends with a close-up of the cross held in Rodriguez's palm. These foreground the religious community that shares a strong faith and does not give it up, suggesting that a paternalistic religion is grounded in a maternal one (Kitamura, 2021, 241–242).

How, then, can strong faith be maintained in such difficult circumstances? In his introduction to the English translation of *Silence*, Scorsese expresses the idea that Rodriguez identifies himself with Christ, stating that "Rodriguez believes, with all his heart, that he will be the hero of a Western story that we all know very well" and he "will be the Christ figure" (2015, viii). Indeed, this interpretation is also not impossible in the Japanese source text. For instance, when Rodriguez is dragged around Nagasaki, he regards himself as Christ: "Here he was riding through the streets of Nagasaki on a donkey. Another man had entered Jerusalem, riding a donkey as well. And it was that man who had taught him that the most noble expression on the face of man is the glad acceptance of injury and insult" (Endō, 1981, 245). Interestingly, Scorsese's cinema depicts Rodriguez identifying his own face with that of Jesus as a strong man.

What does it mean to identify with Jesus? To address this, Slavoj Žižek's (2001) views on faith, presented in his book On Belief, are instructive. For Žižek, when Jesus Christ asks, "My God, my God, why have you abandoned me?" [Mark 15:34], he expresses the view that "when I, a person, experience myself as separated from God, at the very moment of His abandonment, I draw absolutely closer to God, for I am in the same position as the abandoned Christ." That is, when a believer sees him- or herself as part of the divine singularity of the abandoned son of God, he or she believes that he or she and God are one. If Scorsese's cinema does not primarily concern finding God or Jesus Christ as a mother struggling with him, but instead tells a story that shows the strength of one's own piety, then what Scorsese

shows is that by identifying with Jesus Christ, a believer can realize that he or she is one with God and thus can maintain in faith by keeping it strong.

III. Jesus Christ Covered with a Red Garment

Shinoda's cinema is considered to be further from the source text and more altered than Scorsese's. The changes are wide-ranging, but Kitamura (2021) provides a concise summary of the most significant ones. According to Kitamura, first, the image of Jesus in Rodriguez's mind remains that of the strict father. Second, in the scene of the *fumi-e*, Rodriguez does not hear or imagine a voice saying, "Step on it." Third, after Rodriguez steps on the *fumi-e*, Kichijirō never arrives. Finally, the cinema ends with Rodriguez, who has apostatized and received a Japanese name, covering his Japanese wife and devouringly making violent love to her body. With this, it should also be observed that the contents of "The Diary of an Officer" are not represented at all, nor is Rodriguez's final monologue on faith and God. With these changes, Shinoda's version is not seen as a play about faith for the weak or a story that shows the strength of piety, but rather a tale of defeat without redemption, the death of a person's life as a missionary, and a sensual narrative created with an exotic eye that does not share the spirit of pious Catholicism. The red garment featured in the cinema and the scenes related to it, but not in the source story, make the story more effective from this point of view. Kitamura also states that "the world Shinoda saw in the rural areas of the Edo period was a very exotic Japan, with exotic scenery, *geisha* coming and going, and prostitutes dressed in *kimono*s" (2021, 222). Thus, on this view, Shinoda's goal was to cause *Silence* to be seen as a bad example of Christian literature, as described earlier.

However, this view can be called into question by the appearance and use of the red garment; this apparition causes a problem for those who see the cinema as a departure from the source. In one notable scene involving the red garment, Rodriguez changes into this garment even though he is forced to run and conceal himself from the officials. There is no motivation for him to change his clothes. Why would he go to the trouble of wearing a conspicuous red garment when he needed to hide himself? Moreover, the garment is for a Japanese woman. No satisfactory answer to this appears to have been proposed.

Here, there are at least three possibilities. First, the garment may serve as a foreshadowing device for the English speaker. In this cinema, both Japanese and Portuguese characters speak Japanese and English; however, when they speak Japanese, English translations are displayed as captions. In 1971, the year the film was released, to the Japanese, English speakers were perceived as Americans, British, Australians, New Zealanders, Canadians, and Europeans. I have asked native English speakers from these cultures to describe their impressions of the garment's use, and they reported feeling that the color red was a sign of impending bad news. In fact, after putting on the red garment, Rodriguez is caught by the officials, brought before the people, and has stones thrown at him by them. This is the scene mentioned earlier, in which Rodriguez is dragged around Nagasaki and thinks of himself as Christ. The second possibility is that the garment represents a feminized priest and Jesus Christ. A viewer who was aware that this red garment is one that a Japanese woman would wear would understand Rodriguez as having been feminized, meaning that he and Jesus Christ, or those who are weary and suffering, have been feminized. Further, Rodriguez accepts and hence forgives his Japanese wife, who abandoned her faith in Christianity, and this attitude goes along with his embodiment of a feminized Christ.

Third, Rodriguez, dressed in the red garment, would represent the captured Jesus Christ; the hidden Christians in Nagasaki would surely see him in this way. In particular, Rodriguez's figure in the red Japanese garment in Shinoda's cinema (Figure 1) bears a certain resemblance to a specific Christian relic. This is a metal tablet bearing the words "Ecce homo," a prized

possession of the hidden Christian in Nagasaki in the 17th century (Figure 2). The image shown on the metal tablet represents the scene in which the captured, bearded, and slender Christ is brought before the people with a fatigued and weakened face, wearing a red cloak and a crown of thorns, and holding a rod of reeds in his hand. This is intended to mimic a king's costume and to insult Christ, its wearer, for the sin of having blasphemed God and deceived the people by claiming to be the Messiah (Savior). Messiah also means "king," and Christ was thus ridiculed by soldiers who dressed him up as a king. This image of Christ also suits the character of Rodriguez in *Silence*. After donning the red garment, Rodriguez is condemned for his sin by Japanese soldiers (*samurai* of the Shogunate and the magistrate) and ridiculed by the people, who throw stones at him, for claiming to be a false messiah who misleads the Japanese people's minds with lies, and then he is forced to apostatize. However, for the Christians in Nagasaki, Rodriguez is the very Jesus who takes their place. He bears their sins on the cross. The hidden Christians in Nagasaki disguise their Christian identity through various devices—one of these is the use of the *Ecce homo* metal tablet, made to appear as a Japanese doll through dressing the image of Jesus Christ, which is an image of Christ as a baby in the arms of Mary, in a red Japanese garment.

Shinoda must have seen and known this image. His cinema showcases historical artifacts, including examples of fumi-e (Figures 3 and 4), which are also found in museums in Nagasaki. The metal tablet of Christ wearing the red Japanese garment is also often on display, usually beside or very near instances of fumi-e in museums (currently, it can be seen at the Nagasaki Museum of History and Culture). Doubtless, Shinoda saw this relic and superimposed the image of a weak and struggling Christ on Rodriguez.

Rodriguez meets the death of his life as a priest while stepping on the *fumi-e*, that is, at the point of apostasy. This is tantamount to his own death on the cross, bearing the sins of his people. After that time, he lived as an ordinary person. This way of life is represented in the sex scene at the end. However, because his new life is represented sexually, pushing aside various other possible representations, itself, indicates the possibility that Rodriguez continues to have a strong faith. Rodriguez discusses the Catholic affirmation of marriage with Inoue, saying, "Our church teaches monogamy" (Endō, 1981, p. 191). In addition, Rodriguez tells the Japanese interpreter about the Christian God's support of sexual desire and sexual intercourse in religious questions and answers, saying, "If only man faithfully observes the commandments of our Deus, he should be able to live in peace. […] when we cannot cast away the desires of flesh, God does not order us to avoid all contact with women; rather does he tell us to have one wife and do his divine will" (Endō, 1981, 141–142). When he has sexual intercourse with his wife, then, Rodriguez is not behaving in a depraved way but simply following Christian teachings. Moreover, he is faithfully upholding the Bible. Interestingly, Rodriguez's sex scene in this cinema consists primarily in shots of his devouring the mouth of his Japanese wife (Figure 5), and thus echoes what is written in the Song of Songs, which begins with the line "Let him kiss me with the kiss of his mouth" [1:1]. In other words, even after his apostasy, Rodriguez remains faithful to the teachings of Christianity. The Song of Songs has often been interpreted as an analogy for the relationship between Christ and the Christians or between Christ and the church, and if we follow this view, the scene of Rodriguez's sexual intercourse with his wife shows all the more so Rodriguez's love as a Christian; the more he makes love with his wife, the more that God's love prevails in the world.

For these reasons, Rodriguez's story is not simply that of a fallen man and a loser's descent into sexuality. Instead, Rodriguez presents the strength of his faith and the embodiment of a feminized Christ through the red Japanese garment he hastily dons and through the sexual scenes.

Figure 1. *The red garment.* (Shinoda, 1971, 0:44:37)

Figure 2. *Ecce homo metal tablet. Possession of Nagasaki Museum of History and Culture.*

Figure 3. *A fumi-e.* (Shinoda, 1971, 1:21:40)

Figure 4. *A fumi-e.* (Shinoda, 1971, 2:03:49)

Figure 5. *The last scene.* (Shinoda, 1971, 2:08:57)

Conclusion

In this paper, the author discusses the source text and two cinematic versions of *Silence*. First, I showed that *Silence* is a story about feminized and maternalized Christianity. Then, the author discussed Scorsese's cinema, which is based on an English translation that emphasizes the absoluteness of God's existence, and this cinema reproduces the strong faith of the weak, based solely on the assumption of Western paternalistic Christianity. In this sense, while it faithfully reproduces the novel's plot, this cinema is thematically removed from it. Finally, I discussed Shinoda's version, which is considered to be far removed from the source text. In particular, this is due to the red garment featured prominently in it and its ending, which features a scene of sexual intercourse, both of which are absent from the source text. However, the garment alludes to Rodriguez's life as a Christian at the outset. The garment shows an omen of his life and his death as a Christian. The metal tablet of Christ wearing a red garment also indicates this. However, the garment has the connotation of a feminized Christ and Rodriguez's strong faith in Christianity. Rodriguez accepts and hence forgives his Japanese wife, who abandoned her faith in Christianity, and this attitude shows his embodiment of feminized Christ. In the last scene of Shinoda's cinema, Rodriguez's sexual intercourse with his wife shows his continued faith in Christian teaching, in the way that Rodriguez himself speaks of and as discussed in the Bible, especially Song of Songs, and thus his love of the Christian God. It follows that the more he makes love with his wife, the better able God's love is to prevail in the world. In these ways, Shinoda's cinema is closer to the Japanese source text of the novel *Silence* than Scorsese's is.

Acknowledgement: I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the Nagasaki Museum of History and Culture for granting permission to reproduce the photograph of the Ecce Homo metal tablet (Figure 2) in this study.

References

1. Amaro, Bébio Vieira. 2016. "A Study of Christian Facilities in the Port City of Nagasaki." Dissertation, University of Tokyo.
2. Delcor, Aloisio, and Barbaro, Federico. n.d. "The Creed of Christians: On Fumi-e." *Do you know? 41*. Yo no hikari sha, pp. 27–29.

3. Endō, Shūsaku. 1966/1981. *Chinmoku* [*Silence.*] Shinchōsha.
4. Endō, Shūsaku. 1967a. "Chichi no shūkyō・haha no shūkyō――Maria kannon ni tsuite." ["Religion of Father, Religion of Mother: On the Marian Avalokitesvara."] *Bungei 6* (1), pp. 234–239.
5. Endō, Shūsaku. 1967b. "Kaisetsu Etō shi to hitostu no sakuhin." ["Commentary on Mr. Etō and A Certain Work"] *The Collection of Etō Jun's Works 2*, pp. 312–317.
6. Endō, Shūsaku. 1971/1974. *Kirishitan no sato*. [*The Village of Christian*.] Chūōkōronsha.
7. Endō, Shūsaku. 1973/2000. "Ihōjin no kunō." ["Suffering of Gentiles."] *Complete Literature Collection of Endō Shūsaku*. Shinchōsha, pp. 171–182.
8. Endō, Shūsaku. 1992. *Kirishitan jidai ――Jyunkyō to kikyō no rekishi*. [*The Christian Period: A History of Martyrdom and Apostasy*.] Tokyo: Shōgakukan.
9. Endō, Shūsaku. 2015. *Silence*. Translated by William Johnston. Picador Classic.
10. Etō, Jun. 1967. Seijyuku to Sōshitsu. Tokyo: Kawade Shobō Shinsha.
11. Gessel, Van C. 2017. "*Chinmoku* to *Sairensu* = Eigo ken deno kaishaku to hyōka ni tsuite." ["*Chinmoku* and *Silence*: On Evaluation and Interpretation in the English-speaking World."] *Endō Shūsaku to* Chinmoku *wo kataru.* [*Talking about Endō Shūsaku and* Silence.] Nagasaki: Nagasaki Bunkensha, pp. 47–71.
12. Genette, Gérard. 1972/1980. *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*. Translated by Jane. E. Lewin. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
13. Hazama, Yoshiki. 2008. "Kirishitan shinkō ni okeru marichiriyo to 'ko' ni tsuite no ichi kōsatsu." ["A Study on Martyr and the 'Individual' in the Christian Faith."] *Asia, Christianity, and Plurality 6*, pp. 39–56. DOI: ttps://doi.org/10.14989/57712
14. Katō, Muneya, et al. 2017. "Paneru disukassyon － Endō Shūsaku to watashi, soshite 'Nagasaki'." ["Panel Discussion: Endō Shūsaku, I, and 'Nagasaki'."] *Endō Shūsaku to* Chinmoku *wo kataru.* [*Talking about Endō Shūsaku and* Silence.] Nagasaki: Nagasaki Bunkensha, pp. 73–123.
15. Kazusa, Hideo. 1987. *Endō Shūsaku ron.* [*Essay on Endō Shūsaku*.] Tokyo: Shunjūsha.
16. Kitamura, Kyōhei. 2021. *24 furēmu no eigagaku － Eizō hyōgen wo kaitai suru*. [*Cinema Studies in 24 Frames: Dismantling Film Expression*.] Tokyo: Syōyō Shobō.
17. Koizumi, Yurina. 2018. "Senkyōshi no shokan to denshō kara miru shoki senpuku kirishitan shinseishi." ["The History of Mentalities of Early Senpuku Kirishitans as Seen from Letters of Missionaries and Oral Tradition."] *The Study of Nonwritten Cultural Materials* 16, pp. 133–148.
18. Koshida, Saori. 2019. "Endō Shūsaku *Chinmoku* ron － Katari ni okeru 'sabaki' no hitei." [A Study on Endō Shūsaku's *The Silence*: Denial of 'Judgment' in Narrative."] *Japanese Literature Research Notes* 58, pp. 1–14.
19. Lee, Young-Hwa. 2008. "Fuhen to kobetsu no chokōku － Endō Shūsaku *Chinmoku* ron." ["Conflicts between the Universal and the Particular: A Study on Endo Shusaku's *The Silence*."] *Tsukuba Studies in Literature* 26, pp. 165–181 (pp. 104–88).
20. McMillan, James, Tōyama, Kazuyki, Yamane, Michihiko et al. 2003. "Raundo tēburu sōzō to shinkō － Endō Shūsaku *Chinmoku* wo megutte." ["Round Table: Creation and Progression: Endō Shūsaku's *Silence*."] *Mita Bungaku: A Literary Magazine* (3rd Period), 82 (74), pp. 180–195.
21. Onishi, Yasumitsu. 2012. "Endō Shūsaku *Chinmoku* to 'konsarichin (tūkai)': 'Kami no chinmoku' to 'ningen no chinmoku'." [Endō Shūsaku's *Silence* and "contrição (contrition)": Silence of God and Silence of People."] *Bulletin of the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, Department of Humanitie*s 29, pp. 1–11.
22. Ōura Church. n.d. "Nihon no seibo zo." ["The statue of Holy Mother of Japan."] Retrieved on August 5, 2022, from https://nagasaki-oura-church.jp/archives/102.
23. Scorsese, Martin. 2015. "Introduction." In Endō Shūsaku *Silence,* New York: Picador Classic, vii–ix.
24. Shinoda, Masahiro. 1971. *Chinmoku SILENCE*. Tokyo: Toho.

25. Suzuki, Akiyoshi. 2016. “The Black” in Nagasaki: Namban, or Western, culture and colored imperialism. In H. Edo (Ed.), *Imperialism and culture: From Shakespeare to Antonio Negri*, (pp. 281–303). Yokohama: Shunpūsha.
26. Tsuboi, Hideto. 2002. “Hyōshō to shite no shokuminchi.” [“Colonialism as a Representation”]. Komori Yōichi et al, *Hensei sareru nasyonarizumu* [*Organized Nationalism*] *(Iwanami Lecture Series: Cultural History of Modern Japan V)*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, pp. 271–309.
27. Tsuruta, Bunshi. 2006. *Saikai no Nanban bunka tanbō, Gosoku no Kutsu − Maboroshi no Nagasaki hen, kaname no Shimabara hen*. [*Cultural Exploration, Five Shoes: Illusory Nagasaki and Indispensable Shimabara.*] Nagasaki: Nagasaki Bunkensha.
28. Urakawa, Wasaburō (Ed.). 1915. *Nihon ni okeru kōkyōkai no fukkatsu, Zenpen*. [*Revival of the Public Church in Japan Part I*.] Nagasaki: Tenshudō.
29. Ryū, Kankichi. 1968. “Kirishitan bungaku ni tsuite.” [“On Christian Literature.”] Yamada Norio (Ed.), *Kirishitan Bungaku shū* [*Collection of Christian Literature*], pp. 259–268.
30. Yamada, Norio (Ed.). 1968. *Kirishitan bungaku shū.* [*Collection of Christian Literature*.] Tokyo: Saginomiya Shobō.
31. Žižek, Slavoj. 2001. *On Belief*. New York: Routledge.